

SOUTH YORKSHIRE FIRE & RESCUE AUTHORITY

Meeting	FIRE AND RESCUE AUTHORITY
Meeting Date	15 APRIL 2024
Report of	CHIEF FIRE OFFICER AND CHIEF EXECUTIVE
Report Sponsor(s)	DEPUTY CHIEF FIRE OFFICER, DIRECTOR OF SERVICE DELIVERY
Subject	ELM LANE REBUILD

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

In 2022 the Fire Authority approved the construction approach of modular buildings for fire stations that were deemed to require a replacement. The first concept station was identified as Elm Lane Station in Sheffield.

Despite initial market research and engagement with several modular suppliers, this report identifies several issues with modular as concept, primarily focused on cost and quality concerns. Due to these concerns, 3 alternative construction approaches will be evaluated with the findings expected to be shared in autumn 2024.

These are:

- Traditional build
- Modular led-build
- Full refurbishment

RECOMMENDATION(S)

Members are recommended to:-

- a. Accept commencement on further costing investigation which considers 3 alternative routes to the previously plans.

CONTENTS

Main Report

BACKGROUND

1. In October 2022 the Fire and Rescue Authority approved the construction approach of modular buildings for fire stations that were deemed to require a replacement. The first concept station was identified as Elm Lane fire station in Sheffield.
2. Since sign off of this approach 2022, we have successfully appointed a multi-disciplinary contractor through the NHS SBS framework; Black Cat Building Consultancy (BCBC). BCBC was successful in the mini competition, demonstrating a huge enthusiasm for their projects, transparent communications and a smaller team to allow for more agility.
3. The NHS SBS framework – Modular Buying Guide SBS10091 was selected as the route to market by South Yorkshire Fire and Rescue (SYFR and BCBC) which consisted of a rigorous 3 stage process. The stages consisted of:
 - CA1 - an expression of interest issued 18 May 2023.
 - CA2 - a capability assessment issued 9 August 2023.
4. There were a total of 6 suppliers who completed this stage, with 4 being selected for the final tender stage by SYFR and BCBC. The final tender stage requested full costings for a design created through site surveys and extensive internal consultation. This tender specified the quality of materials required for the build, along with a timescale for delivery. Despite initial high interest, 3 suppliers withdrew from the tender citing logistical issues and/or commercial viability.
5. Therefore only 1 supplier submitted a tender. This return equated to a 53% higher than the original cost estimate determined by the Cost Manager at BCBC and 188% higher cost than was initially projected during pre-tender discussions with suppliers.
6. Some factors have been identified during this process which may have contributed to the increase in costs such as the continuing increase in building material and labour costs, timings of tender issue being around the same time as the national RAAC news and a design which requires a bespoke modular set up rather than an “off the shelf” product. Additional concerns were also received around cost and finish quality of the build affecting longevity and future remedial costs.
7. Post tender discussions have been explored with the 1 supplier to understand costs and approach and to identify any possible cost reductions. The supplier engineered an 18% reduction but this would involve changes to some areas of the design.
8. BCBC produced a full tender evaluation report which included an estimate cost for a traditional build based on BCIS “Highest” rate for 500 – 2000m² fire station in November 2023 – demonstrating that a traditional build could be achieved within the original budget envelope. The report also explores further observations on the modular industry. In summary the benefits of modular are still being realised in public sector settings and are more suited to industries with larger scale projects with consistent pipelines and a repetitive product to achieve the economies of scale stipulated during research.
9. Due to the low number of tender responses, SYFR wanted to understand further options available for the redevelopment of Elm Lane. Therefore, SYFR have instructed BCBC to lead further investigation into the following 3 options.

- Traditional Build - SYFR already have a provisional cost for a traditional block build. Development of an external design will be required along with the assessment of risks and timings associated with this method.
 - Modular Led – To request a cost from a modular supplier based on their most cost efficient production solution which maintains the quality previously specified.
 - Full refurbishment - Completing a full condition survey which considers the foundations and structural elements of the current Elm Lane fire station. If this is considered sound, it would be proposed that the current Elm Lane Fire Station would be stripped back to brick with a redesign of the internal structure to match requirements of the modern fire and rescue service. The design which resulted from internal consultation, would be used as a base point to define room specification and layout within the current building structure, with the possibility of minor extensions and demolitions. We will also look to introduce more sustainable M&E supplies as to align to our Green Plan such as air source heat pumps and solar PV. The building's exterior would also include an overhaul to ensure better insulation solutions than what is currently in place.
10. SYFR are still invested in redeveloping Elm Lane which is still within the SYFR Capital Plan. However we need to be flexible on how this can be delivered. A full analysis which considers the cost, time and risk implications of each of the 3 options will be created, scrutinised and presented in Autumn 2024.
11. SYFR are not able to commit to a time frame for delivery on this project at the moment and whichever route is selected, we will go through our usual procurement process which, due to the value, we anticipate this will be via a tender.

CONTRIBUTION TO OUR ASPIRATIONS

- ☒ **Be a great place to work**- we will create the right culture, values and behaviours to make this a brilliant place to work that is inclusive for all
- ☐ **Put people first**- we will spend money carefully, use our resources wisely and collaborate with others to provide the best deal to the communities we serve
- ☐ **Strive to be the best in everything we do**- we will work with others, make the most of technology and develop leaders to become the very best at what we can be

CONTRIBUTION TO SERVICE IMPROVEMENT

- ☐ [HMICFRS Inspection Framework e.g. Diagnostic area and/ or diagnostic questions](#)
- ☐ [SYFR Inspection report Areas for Improvement \(AFIs\)](#)
- ☐ [Fit for the Future Improvement Objectives](#)
- ☒ [Professional Standards for Fire & Rescue Services in England](#)
- ☐ [SYFR Service Plan 2023-24 Priorities](#)
- ☐ [SYFR Community Risk Management Plan 2021-24](#)

Providing improved facilities to colleagues of SYFR that fits with today's standards of the modern fire service.
--

OPPORTUNITIES FOR COLLABORATION

- ☒ Yes
☐ No

If you have ticked 'Yes' please provide brief details in the box below and include the third party/parties it would involve:

Opportunity for letting of flexi-space area to blue light services and new training facility which could be used by SYP, YAS and other FR services.

CORPORATE RISK ASSESSMENT AND BUSINESS CONTINUITY IMPLICATIONS

12. Elm Lane being out of action due to any service disruptions (power etc.) during construction.
13. Reduced training opportunities for crews at Elm Lane

EQUALITY IMPACT ASSESSMENT COMPLETED (

- ☐ Yes

If you have ticked 'Yes' please complete the below comment boxes providing details as follows:

Summary of any Adverse Impacts Identified:	Key Mitigating Actions Proposed and Agreed:

- ☒ No
☐ N/A

This will be completed with the final technical drawing. EDI representatives have been consulted as part of the current consultation period.

HEALTH AND SAFETY RISK ASSESSMENT COMPLETED

- ☐ Yes
☒ No
☐ N/A

H&S has been consulted. A H&S risk assessment will take place when we have the technical drawing and when the cons is complete.

SCHEME OF DELEGATION

14. Under the South Yorkshire Fire and Rescue Authority [Scheme of Delegation](#) a decision *is required / *has been approved at Service level.

Delegated Power ☐ Yes
☒ No

If yes, please complete the comments box indicating under which delegated power.

IMPLICATIONS

15. Consider whether this report has any of the following implications and if so, address them below: Diversity, Financial, Asset Management, Environmental and Sustainability, Fleet, Communications, ICT, Health and Safety, Data Protection, Collaboration, Legal and Industrial Relations implications have been considered in compiling this report.

List of background documents		
Report Author:	Name:	Becky Eastes, Project & Programmes Manager
	e-mail:	beastes@syfire.gov.uk
	Tel no:	